

1. 300 Rāmāyanas ... and only one Tipiṭaka?

Contradiction in the Buddha's instructions for meditation and in explanation of Dhamma are many and acknowledged by the Buddha Himself. Each person is different, hence the way they are taught Dhamma and meditation should be also different. See how the Buddha Himself said it..

| | |
|--|--|
| <i>Majjhima Nikāya – 59. Bahuvedanīya Sutta</i> | Translation by Bhikkhu Bodhi ¹ |
| <i>Dvepānanda, vedanā vuttā mayā pariyāyena, tissopi vedanā vuttā mayā pariyāyena, pañcapi vedanā vuttā mayā pariyāyena,</i> | [Ānanda], I have stated two kinds of feeling in one presentation; I have stated three kinds of feeling in another presentation; I have stated five kinds of feeling in another presentation; |
| <i>chapi vedanā vuttā mayā pariyāyena, atthārasapi vedanā vuttā mayā pariyāyena, chattimsapi vedanā vuttā mayā pariyāyena,</i> | I have stated six kinds of feeling in another presentation; I have stated eighteen kinds of feeling in another presentation; I have stated thirty-six kinds of feeling in another presentation; |
| <i>atthasatampi vedanā vuttā mayā pariyāyena.</i> | I have stated one hundred and eight kinds of feeling in another presentation. |
| <i>Evaṃ pariyāyadesito kho, ānanda, mayā dhammo.</i> | That is how the Dhamma has been shown by me in [different] presentations. |
| <i>Evaṃ pariyāyadesite kho, ānanda, mayā dhamme</i> | When the Dhamma has thus been shown by me in [different] presentation, |
| <i>ye aññamaññassa subhāsitaṃ sulapitaṃ na samanujānissanti na samanumaññissanti na samanumodissanti tesametaṃ pāṭikaṅkhaṃ –</i> | It may be expected of those who will not concede, allow, and accept what is well stated and well spoken by others |
| <i>bhaṇḍanaajātā kalahajātā vivādāpannā aññamaññiṃ mukhasattihi vitudentā viharissanti.</i> | that they will take to quarreling, brawling, and disputing, stabbing each other with verbal daggers. |
| <i>Evaṃ pariyāyadesite kho, ānanda, mayā dhamme ye aññamaññassa subhāsitaṃ sulapitaṃ samanujānissanti samanumaññissanti samanumodissanti tesametaṃ pāṭikaṅkhaṃ – samaggā sammodamānā avivadamānā khīrodakībhūtā aññamaññiṃ piyacakkhūhi sampassantā viharissanti”.</i> | But it may be expected of those who concede, allow, and accept what is well stated and well spoken by others that they will live in concord, with mutual appreciation, without disputing, blending like milk and water, viewing each other with kindly eyes. |

The discrepancies in the Buddha's teachings are therefore perfectly correct and have to be accepted as they are. Note, that the editions to the Pāḷi texts that were done later are meticulously described in the Pāḷi Commentaries,² so that the heretics cannot say “this was made later, this was made earlier” based on uncertain hypotheses whenever one text or another doesn't fit their unenlightened believes.

¹ "The Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha, A Translation of the Majjhima Nikāya", Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli and Bhikkhu Bodhi, Wisdom Publications, Boston, 2009 [first edition in 1995]; p.503 .

² For example added verses at the end of Mahāparinibbāna Sutta, changed order of verses in Jātakas, added *sutta* in Majjhima Nikāya (Bākula Sutta) etc. In a future NewPilgrim I hope to make a complete list of all that I found.

Coming to the conclusion that a *sutta* was not taught by the Buddha would be identical with rejecting the Buddha Himself! And *sutta* is everything what the Buddha said Himself – including Abhidhamma.

| Pāli original ³ | English Translation ⁴ |
|--|--|
| <i>Suttādīsu pana suttam nāma tisso saṅgītiyo ārūlhāni tīṇi piṭakāni.</i> | But in the list [of four things] beginning with <i>sutta</i> , <i>sutta</i> means the three baskets ⁵ which the three Councils recited. |
| <i>Suttānulomaṃ nāma anulomakappiyaṃ.</i> | "Accordance with <i>sutta</i> " means legitimate by being in accord [with what is explicitly legitimate]. |
| <i>Ācariyavādo nāma aṭṭhakathā.</i> | "The word of a teacher" means the commentary. |
| <i>Attanomaṭi nāma nayaggāhena anubuddhiyā attano paṭibhāṇaṃ.</i> | "One's own opinion" means one's own illumination through grasping an analogy or one's consequent understanding. |
| <i>Tattha suttam appaṭibhāhiyaṃ, taṃ paṭibhāhantena buddhova paṭibhāhito hoti.</i> | Of these, sutta should not be rejected, for he who rejects that rejects the Buddha himself. |
| <i>Anulomakappiyaṃ pana suttena samentameva gahetabbaṃ, na itaraṃ.</i> | If what is legitimate by being in accord agrees with the <i>sutta</i> , it should be accepted, but otherwise not. |
| <i>Ācariyavādopi suttena samentoyeva gahetabbo, na itaro.</i> | If the word of a teacher agrees with the <i>sutta</i> , it should be accepted, but otherwise not. |
| <i>Attanomaṭi pana sabbadubbālā, sāpi suttena samentāyeva gahetabbā, na itarā.</i> | One's own opinion is weakest of all, but if it agrees with the <i>sutta</i> , it should be accepted, but otherwise not. |

Unlike the main Pāli Tipiṭaka, the Commentaries are however a completely different story. First they were rehearsed in Pāli (or Māgadhi if you will) as oral tradition by the elders of the First Buddhist Council. Then they were transported to Sri Lanka and translated to Sinhalese. From that version we have our Pāli Commentaries, translated from the Sinhalese by ven. Buddhaghosa, ven. Dhammapāla, and others. It is very clear that the version of Commentaries we have today is a compilation, not a meticulous translation. It seems as if we had a huge elaboration on the sources, rather than their direct translation. Thus we find there enormous amount of added information regarding geography, history, socio-political events and other subjects of the translators' time. We also find there very interesting stories about many Arahants and interesting persons from the time of the translators. Unfortunately, many of the important pieces of information are not supplied with reference, and in other cases when reference is given, it is a book that is no more available to us. I would like to share a story which ought to be same in three different books of the Pāli Commentaries, but the versions are different. Compare yourself ☺ .

³ (1) *Dīgha Nikāya Aṭṭhakathā – Mahāvagga-Aṭṭhakathā – 3. Mahāparinibbānasuttavaṇṇanā – Catumahāpadesavaṇṇanā*; (2) *Khuddaka Nikāya Aṭṭhakathā – Nettippakaraṇa-Aṭṭhakathā – 4. Paṭiniddesavāraṇṇanā – 3. Uttihāravibhaṅgavaṇṇanā*

⁴ "The Buddha's Last Days – Buddhaghosa's Commentary on the Mahāparinibbāna Sutta", Yang-Gyu An, PTS, Oxford, 2005; pp.120-121 .

⁵ The *ti-piṭaka*, namely Vinaya Piṭaka, Sutta Piṭaka, and Abhidhamma Piṭaka.

The story goes that Māgaṇḍiyā, one of the three queens of king Udena, wanted to take revenge against the Buddha who insulted⁶ her saying He would not even touch her with His foot.⁷ (This however is no problem for the Buddha, because the verse was meant for her parents – who, upon its utterance, (attentively listening to the Buddha’s discourse on Dhamma - according to the *Arig.A.*), became Non-Returners (*Anāgāmi*s)).⁸ To take revenge against the Buddha, I mean for the fact that He insulted her, Māgaṇḍiyā tried to chase Him away from Kosambī (not successfully), and then at least have His devout follower, Sāmāvatī – another of the three wives of king Udena – executed. The stories of this execution are however different in the *Dhammapada* Commentary, in *Visuddhimagga*, and in the Commentary for *Ariguttara Nikāya*, and I am sharing with you the original versions so that you yourself can compare. Ven. Buddhaghosa is not the author of the Pāli Commentary that contains the *Dhammapada* story, and his version, unlike the version of ven. Dhammapāla (the translator of the *Dhammapada* Commentary) does not contain a verse. Therefore I assume that ven. Buddhaghosa narrated the *Visuddhimagga* story from hearsay, whereas ven. Dhammapāla simply translated the text he was given. This would be fine if there were not a third version (yes! a third version!) in the Commentary to *Ariguttara Nikāya* – translated by ven. Buddhaghosa. Intriguingly, it is extension of the *Visuddhimagga* story, and it also doesn’t contain a verse.

***Dhammapada* Commentary Version (translated by ven. Dhammapāla)**

| <i>Dhammapada Aṭṭhakathā - Pāḷi</i> ⁹ | English Translation ¹⁰ |
|---|--|
| <i>Tadā pana rājā "sāmāvatīyā vāsuladattāya māgaṇḍiyāya cā"ti tissannampi etāsaṃ pāsādātale vārena vārena sattāhaṃ sattāhaṃ vītināmeti.</i> | Now at this time the king was accustomed to divide his time equally among his three consorts, Sāmāvatī, Vāsuladattā, and Māgaṇḍiyā, spending seven days by turns in the apartment of each. |
| <i>Atha naṃ "sve vā parasuve vā sāmāvatīyā pāsādātalaṃ gamissati"ti ṇātva māgaṇḍiyā cūlapitu sāsanaṃ pahīni –</i> | Māgaṇḍiyā, knowing that he would go on the morrow or on the day after to the apartment of Sāmāvatī, sent word to her uncle, |
| <i>"agadena kira dāṭhā dhovivā ekaṃ sappam pesetū"ti.</i> | "Send me a snake, first washing its fangs with a poisonous drug." |
| <i>So tathā katvā pesesi.</i> | He did as she told him to and sent her a snake. |
| <i>Rājā attano gamanaṭṭhānaṃ hatthikantavīṇaṃ ādāyayeva gacchati, tassā pokkhare ekaṃ chiddaṃ atthi.</i> | Now wherever the king went, he was accustomed to take with him his lute for charming elephants, and in the shell of this lute was a hole. |

⁶ Unpleasant-truthful-meaningful is one of the kinds of speech uttered by the Buddha. Monks are not allowed (although not specifically "prohibited") this particular kind of speech.

⁷ *'Dhammapada-Aṭṭhakathā - 2. Appamādavaggo - 1. Sāmāvatīvattthu*

'Disvāna taṇhaṃ aratiṃ ragañca, Nāhosi chando api methunasmiṃ; Kīmevidaṃ muttakarīsapuṇṇaṃ, Pādāpi naṃ samphusituṃ na icche'ti. = 'Having seen Craving, Pining, and Lust, - I had no desire for the pleasures of love. What is this body, filled with urine and dung? I should not be willing to touch it, even with my foot.' "Buddhist Legends – Translated from the original Pali text of the *Dhammapada Commentary*", Eugene Watson Burlingame, Harvard University Press, Cambridge, 1921; Part 1, p.276 . If you don't like my word "insult", then perhaps think that this story was entirely created by inventive Buddhist scribes. I see no way how a lady, being told this kind of verse, would not feel insulted. A wrong way of insulting a lady, really badly done, can be seen in the introduction story to *Sarighādisesa no.4* of ven. Udāyī and a young widow. Unlike ven. Udāyī, the Buddha said what was to be said through the highest understanding of *aniccā*, *dukkha*, and *anattā*, without any kind of lust, defilement, or ego. That being said, monks should avoid speech which is unpleasant, even if it were true and purposeful.

⁸ The Buddha doesn't teach Dhamma in order to be sweet or pleasant. The Buddha teaches Dhamma in such a way that the listeners attain Enlightenment, get free from greed, hatred, and ignorance. There would be a little concern if somebody suffered or died on account of that – because another person's Enlightenment is the ultimate end of suffering, therefore it outweighs suffering of others. This explains the strange deaths and hardships that certain people suffered after they listened to the Buddha's teachings. (See for example the introduction story of third *Pārājika*, the rule about non-killing. The Commentary basically gives the same explanation as I have given above.)

⁹ *Dhammapada-Aṭṭhakathā - 2. Appamādavaggo - 1. Sāmāvatīvattthu*

¹⁰ "Buddhist Legends – Translated from the original Pali text of the *Dhammapada Commentary*", by E.W. Burlingame, Harvard University Press, Cambridge, 1921; vol.1, pp.285-286 .

| | |
|--|---|
| <i>Māgaṇḍiyā tena chiddena sappam pavesetvā chiddam mālāguḷena thakesi.</i> | Māgandiyā inserted the snake in the hole and stopped the hole with a bunch of flowers; |
| <i>Sappo dvīhatīhaṃ antovīnāyameva ahosi.</i> | for two or three days the snake remained within the lute. |
| <i>Māgaṇḍiyā rañño gamanadivase "ajja katarissitthiyā pāsādam gamissasi devā"ti pucchitvā</i> | On the day when the king was to go to Sāmāvatī's apartment, Māgandiyā asked him, "To whose apartment will you go to-day, your majesty?" |
| <i>"sāmāvatīyā"ti vutte, "ajja mayā, mahārāja, amanāpo supino diṭṭho.</i> | "To Sāmāvatī's apartment." Said Māgandiyā, "Your majesty, to-day I had a bad dream; |
| <i>Na sakkā tattha gantum, devā"ti?</i> | you must not go there." |
| <i>"Gacchāmevā"ti.</i> | "I am going all the same." |
| <i>Sā yāva tatiyaṃ vāretvā,</i> | Three times she tried to dissuade him from going and failed. |
| <i>"evaṃ sante ahampi tumhehi saddhiṃ gamissāmi, devā"ti vatvā</i> | Finally she said, "In that case I will go too." |
| <i>nivattiyamānāpi anivattitvā, "na jānāmi, kiṃ bhavissati devā"ti rañña saddhiṃyeva agamāsi.</i> | In spite of the king's protests she went with him, saying, "Your majesty, I do not know what will happen to you." |
| <i>Rājā sāmāvatimissikāhi dinnāni vatthapupphagandhābharaṇāni dhāretvā subhojanam bhuñjitvā viṇam ussīsaṃ ṭhapetvā sayane nipajji.</i> | The king, wearing garments, flowers, perfumes, and ornaments given him by Sāmāvatī and her followers, ate heartily, and then placed his lute by his pillow and lay down on the bed. |
| <i>Māgaṇḍiyā aparāparam vicarantī viya hutvā viṇachiddato pupphaguḷam apanesi.</i> | Māgandiyā, pretending to be merely walking back and forth, removed the bunch of flowers from the opening in the lute; |
| <i>Sappo dvīhatīhaṃ nirāhāro tena chiddena nikkhamitvā passasanto phaṇam katvā sayanapiṭṭhe nipajji.</i> | Whereupon the snake, which had been without food for two or three days, glided from the opening, hissed, raised his hood, and coiled himself up on the top of the bed. |
| <i>Māgaṇḍiyā taṃ disvā, "dhī dhī, deva, sappo"ti mahāsaddam katvā rājānañca tā ca akkosanti,</i> | When Māgandiyā saw the snake, she screamed with a loud voice, "Oh, your majesty, there is a snake!" And she straightway abused the king, saying, |
| <i>"ayaṃ andhabālarājā alakkhiko mayhaṃ vacanam na suṇāti, imāpi nissirikā dubbinitā, kiṃ nāma rañño santikā na labhanti,</i> | "This stupid, unlucky king will not listen to anything I say to him. As for these shameless scoundrels, what do they not receive from the king? |
| <i>kiṃ nu tumhe imasmim mateyeva sukhaṃ jīvissatha, jīvante dukkhaṃ jīvatha,</i> | You will live happily just as soon as the king is dead, but so long as he lives, you will have a hard time. |
| <i>'ajja mayā pāpasupino diṭṭho, sāmāvatīyā pāsādam gantum na vaṭṭati"ti vārentiyāpi me vacanam na suṇasi, devā"ti āha.</i> | Your majesty, when I cried out to you, "To-day I had a bad dream; you must not go to Sāmāvatī's apartment," you would not listen to what I said." |
| <i>Rājā sappam disvā maraṇabhayaatajjito</i> | When the king saw the snake, he was terrified with the fear of death, |
| <i>"evarūpampi nāma imā karissanti,</i> | the fire of anger was kindled within him, and he said, "So this is the sort of thing they are capable of doing! |
| <i>aho pāpā, ahaṃ imāsaṃ pāpabhāvaṃ ācikkhantiyāpi imissā vacanam na saddahiṃ,</i> | What criminals they are! Yet I would not believe Māgandiyā when she told me of their evil nature. |
| <i>paṭhamam attano gabbhesu chiddāni katvā nisinnā, puna mayā pesite kukkuṭe paṭipahiṇimsu,</i> | First they made holes in the walls of their own rooms and sat there; again, when I sent the cocks to them, they sent them back; |
| <i>ajja sayane sappam vissajjimsū"ti kodhena sampajjalito viya ahosi.</i> | To-day they have let a snake loose in my bed." |
| <i>Sāmāvatīpi pañcannaṃ itthisatānaṃ ovādam adāsi –</i> | Sāmāvatī delivered the following admonition to her five hundred women, |
| <i>"ammā, amhākaṃ aññaṃ paṭisaraṇaṃ natthi,</i> | "Friends, we have no other refuge. |
| <i>narinde ca deviyā ca attani ca samameva mettacittam pavattetha,</i> | Cherish precisely the same feelings towards the king and the queen as you do towards yourselves. |
| <i>mā kassaci kopaṃ karitthā"ti.</i> | Be not angry with anyone." |
| <i>Rājā sahassthāmaṃ siṅgadhanuṃ ādāya jiyam pothetvā visapītaṃ saram sannayhitvā</i> | The king took his horn-bow, which required a thousand men to string, twanged the bowstring, fitted a poisoned arrow to the string, |
| <i>sāmāvatim dhure katvā sabbā tā paṭipāṭiyā ṭhapāpetvā sāmāvatīyā ure saram vissajjesi.</i> | And placing Sāmāvatī in front, and all the other women in single file behind her, shot an arrow at Sāmāvatī's breast. |

| | |
|--|--|
| <i>So tassā mettānubhāvena paṭinivattitvā āgatamaggābhimukhova hutvā</i> | But through the supernatural power of her love the arrow turned back, and returning by the same path it had come, ¹¹ |
| <i>rañño hadayaṃ pavisanto viya aṭṭhāsī.</i> | Penetrated, as it were, the king's heart. ¹² |
| <i>Rājā cintesi – "mayā khitto saro silampi vinivijjhitvā gacchati,</i> | The king thought to himself, "The arrow I shot is capable of piercing even a rock, |
| <i>ākāse paṭihananaṭṭhānaṃ natthi, atha ca panesa nivattitvā mama hadayābhimukho jāto,</i> | and there was nothing in the air to make it turn back. But it turned and came back by the same path it went. ¹³ |
| <i>ayañhi nāma nissatto nijjīvo saropi etissā guṇaṃ jānāti, ahaṃ manussabhūtopi na jānāmī"ti,</i> | Indeed this senseless, lifeless arrow knows her goodness, but I, who am a human being, know not." |
| <i>so dhanuṃ chaḍḍetvā añjaliṃ paggayha sāmāvatīyā pādamūle ukkuṭikaṃ nisīditvā imaṃ gāthamāha –</i> | And throwing the bow away and stretching forth his hands in an attitude of reverent supplication, he knelt before Sāmāvatī's feet and pronounced the following Stanza, |
| <i>"Sammuyhāmi pamuyhāmi, sabbā muyhanti me disā;</i> | I am utterly confused and bewildered; all four quarters are confused in my mind. |
| <i>Sāmāvatī maṃ tēyassu, tvañca me saraṇaṃ bhavā"ti.</i> | Protect me, Sāmāvatī, and be a refuge to me. |

Visuddhimagga Version (translated by ven. Buddhaghosa)

| <i>Visuddhimagga Aṭṭhakathā</i> ¹⁴ | English Translation ¹⁵ |
|--|--|
| <i>Sāmāvatī nāma udenassa rañño aggamahesi.</i> | King Udena's chief queen was called Sāmāvatī. |
| <i>Māgaṇḍiyabrāhmaṇo attano dhītāya aggamahesiṭṭhānaṃ patthayamāno tassā viñāya āsīvisaṃ pakkhipāpetvā</i> | The Brahman Māgaṇḍiya, who aspired to elevate his own daughter to the position of chief queen, put a poisonous snake into Sāmāvatī's lute. |
| <i>rājānaṃ āha "mahārāja, sāmāvatī taṃ māretukāmā viñāya āsīvisaṃ gahetvā pariharatī"ti.</i> | Then he told the king 'Sāmāvatī wants to kill you, sire. She is carrying a poisonous snake about in her lute'. |
| <i>Rājā taṃ disvā kupito sāmāvatīṃ vadhissāmīti dhanuṃ āropetvā visapītaṃ khurappaṃ sannayhi.</i> | When the king found it, he was furious. Intending to kill her, he took his bow and aimed a poisoned arrow. |
| <i>Sāmāvatī saparivārā rājānaṃ mettāya phari.</i> | Sāmāvatī with her retinue pervaded the king with loving-kindness. |
| <i>Rājā neva saraṃ khipituṃ na oropetuṃ sakkonto vedhamāno aṭṭhāsī.</i> | The king stood trembling, unable either to shoot the arrow or to put it away. |
| <i>Tato naṃ devī āha "kiṃ, mahārāja, kilamasi"ti? "</i> | Then the queen said to him 'What is it, Sire, are you tired?' - |
| <i>Āma kilamāmi"ti.</i> | 'Yes, I am tired.' - |
| <i>"Tena hi dhanuṃ oropehi"ti.</i> | Then put down the bow.' |
| <i>Saro rañño pādamūleyeva pati.</i> | The arrow fell at the king's feet. |
| <i>Tato naṃ devī "mahārāja, appaduṭṭhassa nappadussitabba"nti ovadi.</i> | Then the queen advised him 'Sire, one should not hate one who has no hate'. |
| <i>Iti rañño saraṃ muñcituṃ avisahanabhāvo sāmāvatīyā upāsikāya samādhivipphārā iddhīti.</i> | So the king's not daring to release the arrow was success by intervention of concentration in the laywoman Sāmāvatī. ¹⁶ |

¹¹ See the *Dhammmmapada* story for verse 110 about the novice Saṃkicca. When the chief of thieves tried to cut off the novice's head, by the power of the loving-kindness (here *mettā-jhāna*), the sword bent double, and edge struck edge, and next time it split from hilt to tip like a palm-leaf.

¹² "It stayed as if entering the king's heart." – The arrow perhaps only touched the king's breast right at the place of heart.

¹³ "It started (/ "was born") in the direction of my heart."

¹⁴ *Visuddhimagga – 12. Iddhividhaniddeso - Dasaiddhikathā - par. 374*

¹⁵ "The Path of Purification (Visuddhimagga)", Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli, The Corporate Bodz of the Buddha Educational Foundation, Taipei, 2014; p.417 (XII,30).

¹⁶ Ven. Ñāṇamoli directs us to DhA.i,216 (given above) and AA.i,443 (given below).

Āṅuttara Nikāya Commentary Version (translated by ven. Buddhaghosa)

| <i>Āṅuttara Nikāya Aṭṭhakathā</i> ¹⁷ | English Translation by monk Saraṇa ¹⁸ |
|---|--|
| <i>Ayaṃ pana udeno tāsū ekekissā vasanaṭṭhāne satta satta divasāni vasi.</i> | As for this king Udena, he stayed in the residence of each of them, (changing) every seven days. |
| <i>Athāyaṃ māgaṇḍiyā ekaṃ kaṇhasappapotaṃ velupabbe pakkhipāpetvā attano vasanaṭṭhāne ṭhapesi.</i> | At that time this Māgaṇḍiyā had a little cobra inserted in a bamboo joint and kept it in her own residence. |
| <i>Raṇṇo ca yathā katthaci gacchantassa hatthikantaviṇaṃ ādāyayeva gamanaṃ āciṇṇaṃ,</i> | Also, wherever the king would go, he had the habit of going only when (he) took the elephant-charming lute (with him). |
| <i>māgaṇḍiyā raṇṇo attano santikaṃ āgamanakāle taṃ sappapotaṃ antoviṇāya pakkhipitvā chiddaṃ pidahāpesi.</i> | When the king himself approached Māgaṇḍiyā, (she) ordered (her servants) to insert the young snake inside the lute and close up the hole. |
| <i>Atha naṃ sāmāvatīyā santikaṃ gamanakāle, "mahārāja, sāmāvatī nāma samaṇassa gotamassa pakkhā, tumhe na gaṇeti.</i> | Then, when it was the time to come to Sāmāvatī, (Māgaṇḍiyā) said : "Great king, indeed, Sāmāvatī is siding with the ascetic Gotama, (she) doesn't care about you. |
| <i>Yaṃ kiñci katvā tumhākaṃ dosameva cinteti, appamattā hoṭhā"ti āha.</i> | Whatever (she) does, (she) thinks about (you) only with angre, be careful." |
| <i>Rājā sāmāvatīyā vasanaṭṭhāne sattāhaṃ vītināmetvā puna sattāhe māgaṇḍiyāya nivesanaṃ agamāsi.</i> | The king spent seven days in the residence of Sāmāvatī and again came to the residence of Māgaṇḍiyā. ¹⁹ |
| <i>Sā tasmim āgacchanteyeva "kacci te, mahārāja, sāmāvatī otāraṃ na gavesati"ti kathenti viya raṇṇo hatthato viṇaṃ gahetvā cāletvā</i> | (When the king) arrived, as if (she) said "Great king, didn't Sāmāvatī search for a fault in you," (she) took the lute from the king's hands, shook (with it), |
| <i>"kiṃ nu kho, mahārāja, ettha abbhantare vicarati"ti vatvā sappassa nikkhamanokāsaṃ katvā "abbhumme anto sappo"ti viṇaṃ chaḍḍetvā palāyi.</i> | (and) saying "oh, great king, what is it going about inside there?" (she) made way for the snake to escape, (and exclaiming) "Oh my goodness! There's a snake inside!", dropped the lute and ran away. |
| <i>Tasmim kāle rājā padittaṃ veṇuvanaṃ viya pakkhittaloṇaṃ uddhanaṃ viya ca dosena taṭataṭāyanto "vegena saparivāraṃ sāmāvatim pakkosathā"ti āha.</i> | At that moment (/ "time") the king sizzled by wreath like a bamboo forest when ablaze, or like a kitchen tripod when the salt is dropped in, and said "quickly call Sāmāvatī with her retinue!" |
| <i>Rājapurisā gantvā pakkosimsu.</i> | The king's men went and called (them). |
| <i>Sā raṇṇo kuddhabhāvaṃ ṇatvā sesamātugāmānaṃ saññāmadāsi.</i> | She knew that the king was in rage and instructed (/ "gave signal") the other women, ²⁰ |
| <i>"Rājā tumhe ghātetukāmo pakkosati, ajja divasaṃ odissakena mettāpharaṇena rājānaṃ pharathā"ti āha.</i> | Saying: "The king calls (you) because he wants to kill you, (therefore) suffuse the king by suffusing loving-kindness directed (for him)." |
| <i>Rājā tā itthiyo pakkosāpetvā sabbāva paṭipāṭiyā ṭhāpetvā mahādhanuṃ ādāya visapitakaṇḍaṃ sannayhitvā dhanuṃ pūretvā aṭṭhāsi.</i> | After the king called them, (he) arranged (/ "kept") them in a row (/ "orderly"), and taking a big bow he stood with (that) bow in front (of him) charged with a poisoned arrow. |

¹⁷ *Āṅuttara Nikāya (Aṭṭhakathā) – Ekakanipāta-Aṭṭhakathā – 14. Etadaggavaggo – (14) 7. Sattamaetadaggavaggo - Khujjuttarā-sāmāvatīvatthu*

¹⁸ Done with help of the Burmese Pāli-Burmese verbatim translation of the *Āṅuttara Nikāya Aṭṭhakathā* - အင်္ဂုတ္တရနိကာယအတ္ထကထာ [author, publisher, and year of publishing are not mentioned] .

¹⁹ I believe that the residence of Vāsuladattā is omitted simply because it has no purpose here. The sentence doesn't deny the possibility that the king was in Vāsuladattā's residence before he came again to the residence of Māgaṇḍiyā. Of course, what is more important is, that in the *Dhammapada* story the snake was revealed in the Sāmāvatī's residence, but here it is revealed in the residence of Māgaṇḍiyā. (Notice also a number of other differences.)

²⁰ The Burmese translation glosses that they were five hundred, perhaps referring to it being mentioned later. Imagine five hundred people suffusing one single person with loving-kindness. (I've read in a book about mental-healing that even a group of around ten people can heal a person's wound this way, and a story of that as it really happened.)

| | |
|---|--|
| <i>Tasmiṃ khaṇe sabbāva tā sāmāvatippamukhā itthiyo odhiso mettaṃ pharimsu.</i> | At that moment all those ladies led by Sāmāvatī were suffusing (the king) by loving-kindness. |
| <i>Rājā kaṇḍaṃ neva khipituṃ na apanetuṃ sakkoti, gattehi sedā muccanti, sarīraṃ vedhati, mukhato kheḷo patati, gahetabbagahaṇaṃ na passati.</i> | The king is neither able to shoot the arrow, nor is he able to remove (it). Sweat is released from (his) limbs, the body is shaking, saliva drops from (his) mouth, (and) he doesn't see anything what to grasp for. |
| <i>Atha naṃ sāmāvatī "kiṃ, mahārāja, kilamasi"ti āha.</i> | Then Sāmāvatī told him: "Great king, are you tired?" |
| <i>Āma, devī, kilamāmi, avassayo me hohīti.</i> | "Yes, queen, I am tired. Be my refuge." |
| <i>Sādhu, mahārāja, kaṇḍaṃ mahāpathavimukhaṃ karohīti. Rājā tathā akāsi.</i> | "Well, great king, aim the arrow at the great earth." The king did so. |
| <i>Sā "rañño hatthato kaṇḍaṃ muccatū"ti adhiṭṭhāsi. Tasmiṃ khaṇe kaṇḍaṃ mucci.</i> | She determined "may the king release the arrow from (his) hand." At that moment (the king) released the arrow. |
| <i>Rājā taṃkhaṇaṃyeva uduke nimujjivā āgamma allakeso allavattho sāmāvatīyā pādesu pativā</i> | Just then (/ "right at that moment") the king dived into water, and with wet hair and wet clothes, (he) fell at the feet of Sāmāvatī, |
| <i>"khaṃ, devī, mayhaṃ, bhedaḥāṇaṃ me vacanena anupadhāretvā etaṃ kata"nti āha. Khamāmi, devāti.</i> | (and) said: "Forgive me, queen, it was done because I didn't verify the words of backbiters." "I forgive (you), king." |
| <i>"Sādhu, devī, evaṃ tayā mayhaṃ khamitaṃ nāma hoti.</i> | "Well, queen, that means that thus it was forgiven to me by you. |
| <i>Ita paṭṭhāya tumhākaṃ yathāruciyaṃ dasabalassa dānaṃ detha, pacchābhattaṃ vihāraṃ gantvā dhammakathaṃ suṇātha, ajja vo paṭṭhāya pariḥāraṃ dammīti.</i> | From now on (you all) give donation(s) to the One of Ten Powers, ²¹ listen to the talk on Dhamma when you come to the monastery after (midday) meal, ²² from today onwards I give you protection." |
| <i>Tena hi, deva, ajja paṭṭhāya ekaṃ bhikkhuṃ yācitvā ānetha, yo no dhammaṃ vācessatīti.</i> | "If so, king, from today onwards ask for and send (us) a monk, who will discourse Dhamma to us." |
| <i>Rājā satthu santikaṃ gantvā yācanto ānandattheraṃ labhi.</i> | The king approached the Master, and after (his) request he receive the elder Ānanda. |
| <i>Tato paṭṭhāya tā pañcasatā itthiyo therāṃ pakkosāpetvā sakkārasammānaṃ katvā katabhattakiccassa therassa santike dhammaṃ pariyāpuṇanti.</i> | Since then those five hundred ladies called the elder, and after (they) showed their reverence ²³ and when the meal was finished, they studied Dhamma from the elder. |

The differences here are not important, because (in the case of *Visuddhimagga* and the *Ariguttara Nikāya* stories) the main purpose of this story is to encourage yogis to practice loving-kindness (*mettā*), and (in case of *Dhammapada* story) to show that even though Sāmāvatī was incinerated with all her retinue by the following wife of Māgaṇḍiyā, it was in fact Māgaṇḍiyā who lost by accruing bad *kamma* and reputation.

²¹ I.e. the Buddha.

²² The Burmese translation says this means "at the time of night" (ညအခါ၌). *Pacchā* = after, *bhattaṃ* = meal.

²³ The Burmese translation says this means "after they carried out the adoration".

2. Bhikkhunīs : Buddhist Heroines Crucified and Resurrected (A01)

Today one of the world-wide issues of Buddhism is the attempt for revival of *bhikkhunīs*, the nuns of *upasampadā*, the higher ordination. What follows below is not a hundredth or thousandth attempt to prove that *bhikkhunīs* can be revived, or that they are already revived. Although you may not believe that, it is also *not* an attempt to prove that *bhikkhunīs* cannot be revived. It is an attempt to give an objective view, or at least as objective as possible, on the issue – *from both points of view on the issue*. My intention will be to show arguments from both **revivalist** as well as **traditionalist** point of view. I selected the term “revivalist” in order to show that the *bhikkhunī* lineage “died out”,²⁴ and the term “traditionalist” was selected because for centuries the tradition of *bhikkhunīs* was not apparent. There is much more to say about this, but I will let that appear during the progressive development of this series of articles.

When the issue of *bhikkhunīs* is discussed, I would suggest to look at it from three facets. Just like a diamond has several facets, and any of the facet should be cut with utmost care – because otherwise whole diamond might fall into pieces - the issue of *bhikkhunīs* has these three facets, and each should be carefully examined, analyzed, researched, reconsidered, objectively scrutinized and candidly, unreservedly, thoroughly exhibited, so that the final conclusions of this problem will not fail into the darkness of misunderstanding or misperception. The three facets I would like to suggest are:

1. **Scriptural** (containing all relevant *suttas*, rules, explanations, stories, theories, experience and any other details mentioned in Pāli texts of any data, trustworthiness, or appreciation – and well understood together with their background)
2. **Religious** (discussing the relevance of the revivalist and traditionalist point of view with regards to cessation of greed, hatred, ignorance, conceit, establishment of peace and harmony in one’s own mind, and possibilities or acceleration on the path to the attainment of any stage of Enlightenment)
3. **Social** (dealing with the consequences for the modern society with respect to the country, social strata, people’s acknowledgement, international and local development, and peace and harmony in the Buddhist society and society as a whole)

The school of Buddhism called *Theravāda* is so called because it is based on “*vāda*” (teachings) of “*theras*” (elders); in other words, *Theravāda* Buddhism is the Buddhist school particular and outstanding in that it is based on its scriptural tradition. By scriptural tradition I mean not only the scriptures that are “original” (whatever they may be), but also on all the scriptures that developed in dependence on those “original” scriptures and were consequently accepted by senior monks of those times. Interestingly, those monks who didn’t agree with certain later texts that were added to the Canon or Commentaries apparently split from the mainstream and are either recognizable as different schools of Buddhism or disappeared from the surface of Earth. If we are going to talk about *Theravāda bhikkhunī*, then it follows that this issue is consulted in the framework of *Theravāda* Buddhism and its traditional attitude to Pāli scriptures. I will not discuss *bhikkhunī* revival or non-revival of other non-*Theravāda* schools or of those who split from the mainstream *Theravāda* tradition by removing, neglecting, or unfairly underestimating Pāli scriptures of *Theravāda* Buddhism. By their actions they proved that they are no more following the *vāda* of *theras*, being thus worthy of the label “non-

²⁴ The information about *Theravāda bhikkhunī* lineages in countries not famously known as “*Theravāda* Buddhist” will be discussed later. This series of articles will include this information, because they are one of the key objects of this research.

Theravāda”, specifically “non-*Theravāda bhikkhus*” and “non-*Theravāda bhikkhunis*”.²⁵ Some however have perhaps missed certain texts or have perhaps misunderstood them, and those cases, if possible, will be discussed in minute detail with as objective attitude as I can possibly perform.

As strict as it may sound, this is still very open and liberalist attitude in compare to the Burmese case. The Burmese attitude is largely influenced by the historical decline of the Burmese monastic community in terms of numbers of monastics and livelihood. When the British invaded Burma, these “imperialists” (နယ်ချဲ့) carried out their best and hardest attempts to discredit and eliminate all of the local Buddhist belief, which in turn led the Burmese people to be much more grateful and appreciative of whatever they still had (and still have) in their hands, whatever has so far remained from the Buddhist culture and scriptures. This is also the crucial point where the Burmese people decide about “changes” with utmost care and worry for whatever remained of their beloved Buddhism.

I believe that to be “objective”, it is essential to understand “the view of the opposite side” related to the issue, at least unless I am arrogant or biased. To be objective means to relinquish my own expectations, views, and desires, and look at the issue by the eyes of an unaffected observer, or more palatably – of an ideal scientist.²⁶ In this case I am very confident about my aims to be objective, because I see I neither “lose” nor “gain” anything by holding any of the opposing views. For me this research is going to be work of loving-kindness, compassion, patience, self-restraint, and inner development of knowledge and wisdom.

This series of articles will be based on translating the two books about *bhikkhuni* ordination published by the Burmese government, namely:

1. “The Document on Resolution of *Bhikkhuni(s)* Which Explains Whether *Bhikkhuni(s)* Should Be or Should Not Be [included] In The Buddha's Dispensation of *Theravāda* In Present Era.”²⁷ (I have PDF of 97 pages.)
2. “The Resolution on *Bhikkhuni*'s Existence and Non-Existence”²⁸ (I have PDF of 149 pages.)

²⁵ Because the preceding text might have been already forgotten by those readers who are involved in this issue, I have to repeat and emphasize, that *Theravāda* is a tradition particular and outstanding in that it is based on its scriptural tradition. Also, the fact of being “non-*Theravāda*” doesn't mean anything bad. In fact, it doesn't even mean that it would exclude the person from path to Enlightenment or even following the Buddha's true teachings. It just means that the person is not to be misrepresented as a follower of “*Theravāda*”. It is like if you said that I am a bad golfer simply because I am not a member of the Yangonese golf club. That's not right. I can be a good golfer even if I am not a member of the Yagonese golf club! (This was just an example, I've never played golf in my life.)

²⁶ Today there are many scientists who are biased, and there were such scientists throughout history of science whatever that may be. For me “ideal scientist” is someone who has thorough freedom to accept any outcome of his research. An example of attitude of an ideal scientist may be the one expressed by perhaps the greatest physicist of his time, Richard Feynman : “I am just looking to find out more about the world. And if it turns out there is a simple ultimate law that explains everything so be it. That would be very nice discovery. If it turns out it's like an onion with millions of layers and we just sick and tired of looking at the layers then that's the way it is! But whatever way it comes out it's nature, it's there, and she's going to come out the way she is. And therefore when we go to investigate we shouldn't pre-decide what it is we are trying to do except to find out more about it.” (Interview with R. Feynman, video “*The Pleasure of Finding Things Out*”)

²⁷ “ယခုကာလဝယ် ထေရဝါဒဗုဒ္ဓသာသနာတော်၌ ဘိက္ခုနီ ရှိသင့်-မရှိသင့် ပြဆိုရာဖြစ်သော ဘိက္ခုနီဝိနိဗ္ဗာနစာတမ်း” [“*Yakhu Karlaway Thathanatawnai Bhikkhuni Shithint Mashithint Pyahsoya Pshithaw Bhikkhuni Vinicchaya Sar-Tan*”] ; the name of this book was wrongly mentioned in the article “*Buddhist Discrimination Against Women in Modern Burma*” by Saccavadi Bricker, which appeared in the magazine “*Present – The Voices and Activities of Theravada Buddhist Women* | Spring 2010”, pp.13-20 . The wrong translation published on p.19 is: “Decision that Female Burmese Monks of Theravada Buddhism in Modern Burma are Illegal” – the word “illegal” was apparently used out of negative emotion of the author of that article, perhaps replacing the original “Should Be or Should Not Be” .

²⁸ “ဘိက္ခုနီဘာဝိဘာဝ ဝိနိဗ္ဗာန” [“*Bhikkhuni Bhaavaabhaava Vinicchaya*”] ; the name of this book was wrongly mentioned in the article “*Buddhist Discrimination Against Women in Modern Burma*” by Saccavadi Bricker, which appeared in the magazine “*Present – The Voices and Activities of Theravada Buddhist Women* | Spring 2010”, pp.13-20 . The wrong translation published on p.19 is: “Decision that Female Burmese Monks of Theravada Buddhism in Modern Myanmar are Criminals” – the word “criminals” was apparently used out of negative emotion of the author of that article. In fact, whole the part “of Theravada Buddhism in Modern Myanmar are Criminals” is absent from the title of the book. I mark this as (yet another) seriously inappropriate attempt to discredit the Burmese authorities.

Sattajaṭṭila Sutta – First Examine, then Believe

The Buddhist scriptures in *Theravāda* are painstakingly preserved in the form that is viewed as the most original so far available, and following of the scriptures involves not “belief”, but rather study and practice. Let me explain that with an example – I do not have to believe my teacher that he will teach me perfectly Burmese language, and still I can study hard and practice whatever vocabulary and grammar he taught me. Then later I can realize whether his teaching was correct, if I can seamlessly communicate with the Burmese people. So according to this example, where the teacher of Burmese language is like the *Theravāda* scriptures, the Burmese language is like the path to Enlightenment, and studying the Burmese language is like following the *Theravāda* scriptures, I do not have to believe the *Theravāda* scriptures, but I follow them closely, learn, and practice according to them, and consequently watch whether my greed, hatred, and ignorance cease, whether my conceit is decreased, and whether I have a deeper understanding of the reality around me. This should be realized individually. So, before I actually start with the translation, I would like to share with you a *sutta* where the Buddha specifically encourages not to believe anyone until we know (i.e. have tested) him well. It appears in similar forms in *Samyutta Nikāya 1.3.2.1. Sattajaṭṭila Sutta* and *Udāna 6.2. Sattajaṭṭila Sutta*. This would of course apply also to the Buddha and the scriptures, but note that “belief” and “preservation” are two different things.

| <i>Samyutta Nikāya - Sattajaṭṭila Sutta</i> ²⁹ | Translation by ven. Bhikkhu Bodhi ³⁰ |
|---|---|
| 122. <i>Ekam samayaṃ bhagavā sāvatthiyaṃ viharati pubbārāme migāramātupāsāde.</i> | On one occasion the Blessed One was dwelling at Sāvattihī in the Eastern Park in the Mansion of Migāra's Mother. |
| <i>Tena kho pana samayena bhagavā sāyanhasamayaṃ paṭisallānā vuṭṭhito bahidvārakoṭṭhake nisinno hoti.</i> | Now on that occasion, in the evening, the Blessed One had emerged from seclusion and was sitting by the outer gateway. |
| <i>Atha kho rājā pasenadi kosalo yena bhagavā tenupasaṅkami; upasaṅkamitvā bhagavantaṃ abhivādetvā ekamantaṃ nisīdi.</i> | Then King Pasenadi of Kosala approached the Blessed One, paid homage to him, and sat down to one side. |
| <i>Tena kho pana samayena satta ca jaṭilā satta ca nigaṇṭhā satta ca acelakā satta ca ekasāṭakā satta ca paribbājakā parūlhakacchanakhalomā khārivividhamādāya [khārividham ādāya (pī.) dī. ni. 1.280 taddaṭṭhakathāpi oloketabbā] bhagavato avidūre atikkamanti.</i> | Now on that occasion seven jaṭilas, seven nigaṇṭhas, seven naked ascetics, seven one-robed ascetics, and seven wanderers – with hairy armpits, long fingernails and long body hairs, carrying their bundles of requisites – passed by not far from the Blessed One. |
| <i>Atha kho rājā pasenadi kosalo utṭhāyāsanaṃ ekamsaṃ uttarāsaṅgaṃ karitvā dakkhiṇajāṇumaṇḍalaṃ pathaviyaṃ niḥantvā yena te satta ca jaṭilā satta ca nigaṇṭhā satta ca acelakā satta ca ekasāṭakā satta ca paribbājakā tenaṇṇalim paṇāmetvā tikkhattuṃ nāmaṃ sāvesi –</i> | Then King Pasenadi of Kosala rose from his seat, arranged his upper robe over one shoulder, knelt down with his right knee on the ground, and, raising his joined hands in reverential salutation towards the seven jaṭilas, seven nigaṇṭhas, seven naked ascetics, seven one-robed ascetics, and seven wanderers, he announced his name three times: |
| <i>"rājāhaṃ, bhante, pasenadi kosalo...pe... rājāhaṃ, bhante, pasenadi kosalo"ti.</i> | "I am the king, venerable sirs, Pasenadi of Kosala! ... I am the king, venerable sirs, Pasenadi of Kosala!" |

²⁹ *Samyutta Nikāya - Sagāthāvaggapāḷi – 3. Kosalasamyutta – 2. Dutiyavagga – 1. Sattajaṭṭila Sutta*

³⁰ "The Connected Discourses of the Buddha – A translation of the *Samyutta Nikāya*", Bhikkhu Bodhi, Wisdom Publications, Boston, 2000 ; p.173-174 . Endnotes have been omitted to encourage the reader to buy this book as well as to avoid copyright issues. I have also made little edits so that it conforms to the original Pāḷi text.

| | |
|--|---|
| <i>Atha kho rājā pasenadi kosalo acirapakkantesu tesu sattu ca jaṭilesu sattu ca nigaṇṭhesu sattu ca acelakesu sattu ca ekasāṭakesu sattu ca paribbājakesu yena bhagavā tenupasaṅkami; upasaṅkamitvā bhagavantam abhivādetvā ekamantaṃ nisīdi.</i> | Then, not long after those seven jaṭilas, seven nigaṇṭhas, seven naked ascetics, seven one-robed ascetics, and seven wanderers had departed, King Pasenadi of Kosala approached the Blessed One, paid homage to him, sat down to one side. |
| <i>Ekamantaṃ nisīno kho rājā pasenadi kosalo bhagavantam etadavoca –</i> | Sitting on one side, the King Pasenadi of Kosala said to the Blessed One: |
| <i>"ye te, bhante, loke arahanto vā arahattamaggaṃ vā samāpannā ete tesam aññatarā"ti.</i> | "Those, venerable sir, are to be included among the men in the world who are arahants or who have entered upon the path to arahantship." |
| <i>"Dujjānaṃ kho etaṃ, mahārāja, tayā gihinā kāmabhoginā puttasaṃbādhasayanaṃ ajjhāvasantena kāsikacandanaṃ paccaṇubhontena mālāgandhavilepanaṃ dhārayantena jātārūparajataṃ sādhiyanta – 'ime vā arahanto, ime vā arahattamaggaṃ samāpannā'"ti.</i> | "Great king, being a layman who enjoys sensual pleasures, dwelling in a home crowded with children, enjoying the use of Kāsian sandalwood, wearing garlands, scents, and unguents, receiving gold and silver, it is difficult for you to know: 'These are arahants or these have entered upon the path to arahantship.' |
| <i>"Saṃvāseṇa kho, mahārāja, sīlaṃ veditaṃ. Tañca kho dīghena addhunā, na ittaraṃ; manasikarotā, no amanasikarotā; paññavatā, no duppaññena.</i> | "It is by living together with someone, great king, that his virtue is to be known, And that after a long time, not after a short time; by one who is attentive, not by one who is inattentive; by one who is wise, not by a dullard. |
| <i>Saṃvohāreṇa kho, mahārāja, soceyyaṃ veditaṃ. Tañca kho dīghena addhunā, na ittaraṃ; manasikarotā, no amanasikarotā; paññavatā, no duppaññena.</i> | "It is by dealing with someone, great king, that his honesty is to be known, and that after a long time, not after a short time; by one who is attentive, not by one who is inattentive; by one who is wise, not by a dullard. |
| <i>Āpadāsu kho, mahārāja, thāmo veditaṃ. So ca kho dīghena addhunā, na ittaraṃ; manasikarotā, no amanasikarotā; paññavatā, no duppaññena.</i> | "It is in adversities, great king, that a person's fortitude is to be known, and that after a long time, not after a short time, by one who is attentive, not by one who is inattentive; by one who is wise, not by a dullard. |
| <i>Sākaṇḍhāya, kho, mahārāja, paññā veditaṃ. Sā ca kho dīghena addhunā, na ittaraṃ; manasikarotā, no amanasikarotā; paññavatā, no duppaññena"ti.</i> | "It is by discussion with someone, great king, that his wisdom is to be known, and that after a long time, not after a short time; by one who is attentive, not by one who is inattentive; by one who is wise, not by a dullard." |
| <i>"Acchariyaṃ, bhante, abbhutaṃ bhante!</i> | "It is wonderful, venerable sir! It is amazing, venerable sir! |
| <i>Yāva subhāsitamidaṃ, bhante, bhagavatā –</i> | How well this has been stated by the Blessed One: |
| <i>"Dujjānaṃ kho etaṃ, mahārāja, tayā gihinā kāmabhoginā puttasaṃbādhasayanaṃ ajjhāvasantena kāsikacandanaṃ paccaṇubhontena mālāgandhavilepanaṃ dhārayantena jātārūparajataṃ sādhiyanta – 'ime vā arahanto, ime vā arahattamaggaṃ samāpannā'"ti.</i> | "Great king, being a layman who enjoys sensual pleasures, dwelling in a home crowded with children, enjoying the use of Kāsian sandalwood, wearing garlands, scents, and unguents, receiving gold and silver, it is difficult for you to know: 'These are arahants or these have entered upon the path to arahantship.' |
| <i>"Saṃvāseṇa kho, mahārāja, sīlaṃ veditaṃ. Tañca kho dīghena addhunā, na ittaraṃ; manasikarotā, no amanasikarotā; paññavatā, no duppaññena.</i> | "It is by living together with someone, great king, that his virtue is to be known, And that after a long time, not after a short time; by one who is attentive, not by one who is inattentive; by one who is wise, not by a dullard. |
| <i>Saṃvohāreṇa kho, mahārāja, soceyyaṃ veditaṃ. Tañca kho dīghena addhunā, na ittaraṃ; manasikarotā, no amanasikarotā; paññavatā, no duppaññena.</i> | "It is by dealing with someone, great king, that his honesty is to be known, and that after a long time, not after a short time; by one who is attentive, not by one who is inattentive; by one who is wise, not by a dullard. |

| | |
|---|---|
| <i>Āpadāsu kho, mahārāja, thāmo veditabbo. So ca kho dīghena addhunā, na ittaraṃ; manasikarotā, no amanasikarotā; paññavatā, no duppaññena.</i> | "It is in adversities, great king, that a person's fortitude is to be known, and that after a long time, not after a short time, by one who is attentive, not by one who is inattentive; by one who is wise, not by a dullard. |
| <i>Sācacchāya, kho, mahārāja, paññā veditabbā. Sā ca kho dīghena addhunā, na ittaraṃ; manasikarotā, no amanasikarotā; paññavatā, no duppaññenā"ti.</i> | "It is by discussion with someone, great king, that his wisdom is to be known, and that after a long time, not after a short time; by one who is attentive, not by one who is inattentive; by one who is wise, not by a dullard." |
| <i>"Ete, bhante, mama purisā carā ocarakā janapadaṃ ocaritvā āgacchanti.</i> | "These, venerable sir, are my spies, undercover agents, coming back after spying out the country. |
| <i>Tehi paṭhamaṃ ociṇṇaṃ ahaṃ pacchā osāpayissāmi [oyāyissāmi (sī.), ohayissāmi (syā. kaṃ.)].</i> | First information is gathered by them and afterwards I will make them disclose it. |
| <i>Idāni te, bhante, taṃ rajojallaṃ pavāhetvā sunhātā suvilittā kappitakesamassū odātavattā [odātavattavasanā (sī.)] pañcahi kāmaguṇehi samappitā samaṅgībhūtā paricāressanti"ti.</i> | Now, venerable sir, when they have washed off the dust and dirt and are freshly bathed and groomed, with their hair and beards trimmed, clad in white garments, they will enjoy themselves supplied and endowed with the five cords of sensual pleasure." |
| <i>Atha kho bhagavā etamatthaṃ veditvā tāyaṃ velāyaṃ imā gāthāyo abhāsī –</i> | Then the Blessed One, having understood the meaning of this, on that occasion recited these verses: |
| <i>"Na vaṇṇarūpena naro sujāno, Na vissase ittaradassanena;</i> | "A man is not easily known by outward form, Nor should one trust a quick appraisal, |
| <i>Susaññatānañhi viyañjanena, Asaññatā lokamimaṃ caranti.</i> | For in the guise of the well controlled Uncontrolled men move in this world. |
| <i>"Patirūpako mattikākuṇḍalova, Lohaḍḍhamāsova suvaṇṇachanno;</i> | "Like a counterfeit earring made of clay, Like a bronze half-pence coated with gold, |
| <i>Caranti loke [eke (sī. pī.)] parivārachannā, Anto asuddhā bahi sobhamānā"ti.</i> | Some move about in disguise: Inwardly impure, outwardly beautiful." |

There are various ways how Burmese monks believed to be Arahants were examined, are examined, and certainly will be. One of such cases was reported regarding Webu Sayadaw :

"There were (cases) when the sayadaw entered the Dhamma Hall of Inn Lay and was examined – there were unnoticeably erected thorns of rose (on the ground), so that when the sayadaw is coming his face-expression would be disturbed (/ "broken"), (so) there were cases of (such) examining."³¹

In other words, there were set rose-thorns on the floor of the Dhamma hall, so that when the Webu Sayadaw enters the Dhamma hall and steps on them, he will have to grimace by pain .. or not.

³¹ This is my translation of notes made by Ma Htay Htay Lwin. These notes were taken from recordings collected by Ma Snow Aye for the project of Shwe Lan Ga lay, the guide-book of meditation monasteries and culture of Myanmar - <https://www.facebook.com/burmagoldenpath> .

A01 "The Document on Resolution of *Bhikkhunī(s)* Which Explains Whether *Bhikkhunī(s)* Should Be or Should Not Be [included] In The Buddha's Dispensation of *Theravāda* In Present Era."

| PDF page | Burmese original | English translation by monk Saraṇa |
|----------|---|---|
| 01 | ပြည်ထောင်စုမြန်မာနိုင်ငံတော် | The Great Country Union of Myanmar |
| | နိုင်ငံတော်သံဃမဟာနာယကအဖွဲ့မှထုတ်ပြန်သော ယခုကာလဝယ် ထေရဝါဒဗုဒ္ဓသာသနာတော်၌ ဘိက္ခုနီ ရှိသင့် - မရှိသင့် ပြဆိုရာဖြစ်သော ဘိက္ခုနီဝိနိစ္ဆယစာတမ်း | "The Document on Resolution of Bhikkhunī(s) Which Explains Whether Bhikkhunī(s) Should Be or Should Not Be [included] In The Buddha's Dispensation of Theravāda In Present Era" Published by the State Saṅgha Mahā Nāyaka Council. ³² |
| | (စိရံ တိဋ္ဌတု သဒ္ဓမ္မော - ကမ္ဘာအေးစာပုံနှိပ်တိုက်) | (May The True Dhamma Stay Long (Time) – Kaba-Aye Printers) |
| | ပြည်ထောင်စုမြန်မာနိုင်ငံတော်အစိုးရ | The Government of The Great Country Union of Myanmar |
| | သာသနာရေးဝန်ကြီးဌာန၊ သာသနာရေးဦးစီးဌာန | Ministry of Religious Affairs, Department of Religious Affairs, |
| | ကမ္ဘာအေးစာပုံနှိပ်တိုက်၌ရိုက်နှိပ်သည်။ | Printed in the Kaba-Aye Printers. |
| | သာသနာ-၂၅၄၉ ။ ကောဇာ-၁၃၆၇ ။ ၂၀၀၆ | 2549 BE [i.e. Buddhist Era], 1367 ME [i.e. Myanmar Era], 2006 |
| 02 | ပြည်ထောင်စုမြန်မာနိုင်ငံတော် | The Great Country Union of Myanmar |
| | နိုင်ငံတော်သံဃမဟာနာယကအဖွဲ့မှထုတ်ပြန်သော ယခုကာလဝယ် ထေရဝါဒဗုဒ္ဓသာသနာတော်၌ ဘိက္ခုနီ ရှိသင့် - မရှိသင့် ပြဆိုရာဖြစ်သော ဘိက္ခုနီဝိနိစ္ဆယစာတမ်း | "The Document on Resolution of Bhikkhunī(s) Which Explains Whether Bhikkhunī(s) Should Be or Should Not Be [included] In The Buddha's Dispensation of Theravāda In Present Era" Published by the State Saṅgha Mahā Nāyaka Council. ³² |
| | (စိရံ တိဋ္ဌတု သဒ္ဓမ္မော - ကမ္ဘာအေးစာပုံနှိပ်တိုက်) | (May The True Dhamma Stay Long (Time) – Kaba-Aye Printers) |
| | ပြည်ထောင်စုမြန်မာနိုင်ငံတော်အစိုးရ | The Government of The Great Country Union of Myanmar |
| | သာသနာရေးဝန်ကြီးဌာန၊ သာသနာရေးဦးစီးဌာန | Ministry of Religious Affairs, Department of Religious Affairs, |
| | ကမ္ဘာအေးစာပုံနှိပ်တိုက်၌ရိုက်နှိပ်သည်။ | Printed in the Kaba-Aye Printers. |
| | သာသနာ-၂၅၄၉ ။ ကောဇာ-၁၃၆၇ ။ ၂၀၀၆ | 2549 BE [i.e. Buddhist Era], 1367 ME [i.e. Myanmar Era], 2006 ³³ |
| 03 | (သာသနာတော်ထွန်းကားပြန့်ပွားရေးဦးစီးဌာန | (The Department of Radiating and Disseminating the Great Dispensation) |
| | သုတေသနစာကြည့်တိုက် | (The Research Library) |
| | အမှတ် ၂၇၀၅၆ ၊ ရက်စွဲ ၅. ၈. ၀၉ | (Number 27056, date 5. 8. 09) |
| | ရန်ကုန်မြို့ ၊ ကမ္ဘာအေး၊ သာသနာရေး ဝန်ကြီးဌာန သာသနာရေးဦးစီးဌာန၊ ကမ္ဘာအေးစာပုံနှိပ်တိုက်တွင် ညွှန်ကြားရေးမှူး ဦးဇနည်ဝင်း မှတ်ပုံတင်အမှတ် (၀၃၈၄၃/၀၂၄၀၅)က ပုံနှိပ် ထုတ်ဝေသည်။ | Printing and Publishing (undertaken by) Director U Zar Nee Winn, Kaba-Aye Printers, Department of Religious Affairs, Ministry of Religious Affairs, Kaba-Aye, Yangon City Registration Number (03843/02405)ka |
| 04 | မာတိကာ | Contents |
| | စဉ် ။ အကြောင်းအရာ ။ စာမျက်နှာ | Numerical order . Subject . Page (Number) |
| | ၁။ နိဒါန်း ။ က-၄ | 1. Introduction . <i>ka-ta</i> |
| | ၂။ ပရိသတ် ၄-ပါး ။ ၁ | 2. Four Assemblies . 1 |
| | ၃။ ဘိက္ခုနီပရိသတ်ပေါ်ပေါက်လာပုံ ။ ၂ | 3. How the Assembly of Bhikkhunīs Appeared . 2 |
| | ၄။ ဒုတိယအကြိမ် ရဟန်းမအဖြစ် ခွင့်တောင်းခြင်း ။ ၃ | 4. Asking for Permission to Be a Bhikkhunī For the Second Time . 3 |
| | ၅။ ဂရုဓမ္မ ၈-ပါး ။ ၇ | 5. Eight Points of Respect (<i>Garudhammā</i>) . 7 |
| | ၆။ မိထွေးတော်ဂေါတမီ - မြင့်မြတ်သော ရဟန်းမအဖြစ်သို့ ရောက်ခြင်း ။ ၈ | 6. The Royal Step-Mother Gotamī – Coming to the Noble State of Bhikkhunī . 8 |
| | ၇။ မာတုဂါမများ ရဟန်းမ ပြုခြင်းကြောင့် သာသနာတော် တည်ခြင်း/မတည်ခြင်း ။ ၉ | 7. Duration/Non-Duration of the Great Dispensation Due to Ordaining (“Making”) Bhikkhunīs (from) Women . 9 |
| | ၈။ ဧကတောဥပသမ္ပန္န ရဟန်းမအဖြစ် ခွင့်ပြုခြင်း | 8. Permission to Become Bhikkhunī by Single (Side) Higher Ordination (<i>Ekatoupasampanna</i>) . 10 |
| | ၉။ သာကီဝင်မင်းသမီးငါးရာတို့ ဧကတောဥပသမ္ပန္န ရဟန်းမများဖြစ်ကြခြင်း ။ ၁၁ | 9. The 500 Sakyan Princesses Become Bhikkhunīs . 11 |
| | ၁၀။ ရဟန်းမတို့အား ရဟန်းယောက်ျားများနှင့်တန်းတူ အခွင့်အရေးပေးရန် မိထွေးတော်ဂေါတမီ ဆုတောင်းခြင်း ။ ၁၂ | 10. The Wish of Royal Step-Mother Gotamī That Bhikkhunīs Get Permission to Be Equal With Bhikkhus . 12 |
| | ၁၁။ မူလပညတ်လော? ³⁴ အနုပညတ်လော? ။ ၁၃ | 11. Original Rule? Additional Rule? . 13 |

³² Literally “The Great Country’s Council of the (Monastic) Community’s Great Leaders” .

³³ Page one and two are different only in their function – first is the cover page, and the second is the title page.

³⁴ There is a typing mistake “မူလပညတ်လော?” .

| | | |
|----|--|--|
| | ၁၂။ ဋီကာဝါဒ ။ ၁၆ | 12. Interpretation of Sub-Commentaries . 16 |
| | ၁၃။ ဝါဒန္တရ | 13. Different Interpretation |
| | ၁၄။ ဥဘတောဥပသမ္ပန္န ရဟန်းမအဖြစ်ခွင့်ပြုတော်မူခြင်း ။ ၂၁ | 14. The Graceful Permission of Dual Higher Ordination (<i>Ubhatoupasampanna</i>) . 21 |
| | ၁၅။ ပါဠိတော်ချင်း ယှဉ်တွဲစဉ်းစားသင့် ။ ၂၃ | 15. The Pāli Texts Should be Compared and Considered . 23 |
| | ၁၆။ ဥဘတောဥပသမ္ပန္နဘိက္ခုနီပြုလုပ်ပုံ ။ ၂၆ | 16. How Are Bhikkhunīs of Dual Higher Ordination (<i>Ubhatoupasampanna</i>) Ordained (/“Made”) . 26 |
| | ၁၇။ ဘိက္ခုနီအပြား ။ ၂၈ | 17. Enumeration of <i>Bhikkhunīs</i> . 28 |
| | ၁၈။ ဥပသမ္ပဒါ ၈-မျိုးကိုပြဆိုခြင်း | 18. Presentation of the Eight Kinds of Higher Ordination (<i>Upasampadā</i>) |
| 05 | စဉ် ။ အကြောင်းအရာ ။ စာမျက်နှာ | Numerical order . Subject . Page (Number) |
| | ၁၉။ ဘိက္ခုနီဆိုင်ရာ ဥပသမ္ပဒါ ၄-မျိုး ။ ၃၆ | 19. Four Kinds of Higher Ordination (<i>Upasampadā</i>) Related to <i>Bhikkhunī</i> . 36 |
| | ၂၀။ ဘိက္ခုနီသာသနာ ။ ၃၈ | 20. The Dispensation of Bhikkhunīs (<i>Bhikkhunī Sāsana</i>) . 38 |
| | ၂၁။ ဘိက္ခုနီသာသနာ အားနည်းချိန် ။ ၃၉ | 21. (The Time) When the Dispensation of Bhikkhunīs Was Weak . 39 |
| | ၂၂။ အပရန္တတိုင်း ဘိက္ခုနီသာသနာ ။ ၃၉ | 22. The Dispensation of Bhikkhunīs in the Aparanta Region . 39 |
| | ၂၃။ သုဝဏ္ဏဘူမိတိုင်း ဘိက္ခုနီသာသနာ ။ ၄၁ | 23. The Dispensation of Bhikkhunīs in the Suvaṇṇabhūmī Region . 41 |
| | ၂၄။ လင်္ကာဒီပ ဘိက္ခုနီသာသနာ ။ ၄၃ | 24. The Dispensation of Bhikkhunīs in the Island of Laṅkā . 43 |
| | ၂၅။ ဘိက္ခုနီအဆက်အနွယ်ပြတ်ချိန် ။ ၄၇ | 25. The Interruption of the Bhikkhunī Lineage . 47 |
| | ၂၆။ ဘိက္ခုနီသာသနာ ကွယ်ပျောက်ရခြင်းအကြောင်း ။ ၄၉ | 26. About (The Reason Why) The Bhikkhunī Dispensation Had to Disappear . 49 |
| | ၂၇။ ယခုကာလဝယ် ထေရဝါဒဗုဒ္ဓသာသနာတော်၌ ဘိက္ခုနီ မရှိနိုင် ။ ၅၇ | 27. In the Present Era There Cannot Be Bhikkhunīs (included) in the Great Dispensation of Theravāda . 57 |
| | ၂၈။ ထေရဝါဒ ။ ၅၇ | 28. Theravāda . 57 |
| | ၂၉။ ဘိက္ခုနီသံဃာ၌ ရဟန်းမခံရသေးသော မာတုဂါမကို ဘိက္ခုသံဃာက ရဟန်းခံပေးခြင်းငှာ မအပ် ။ ၅၈ | 29. It is not <i>Proper</i> to Give Higher Ordination by Bhikkhu Saṅgha to a Woman Who Has not Yet Been Given Higher Ordination by Bhikkhunī Saṅgha . 58 |
| | ၃၀။ ဧကတောဥပသမ္ပန္နပညတ် ပျက်ပုံ ။ ၆၀ | 30. How the Rule of Single (Side) Higher Ordination Was Discontinued (/“Broken”) . 60 |
| | ၃၁။ ရှင်းလင်းချက် ။ ၆၁ | 31. Clarification . 61 |
| | ၃၂။ ဧကတောဥပသမ္ပန္နရဟန်းမ ပြုခွင့် မရှိတော့ခြင်း ။ ၆၇ | 32. There Is No More Permission For a Bhikkhunī of Single (Sided) Higher Ordination (<i>Ekatoupasampanna</i>) |
| | ၃၃။ ဧကတောဥပသမ္ပန္နရဟန်းမ ပြုခွင့်ကို အထူးပယ်ခြစ်တော်မူခြင်း ။ ၇၁ | 33. The Graceful Happening of Dismissing the Permission of Single (Sided) Higher Ordained Bhikkhunīs . 71 |
| | ၃၄။ ရဟန်းယောက်ျားသည် မာတုဂါမကို ရှင်ပြုပေးရုံသော်မှ မအပ် ။ ၇၃ | 34. For A Bhikkhu It Is Not Proper To Ordain (/“Make”) a Woman Even As a (Female) Novice . 73 |
| | ၃၅။ အကျဉ်းချုပ် ဆုံးဖြတ်ချက် ။ ၇၄ | 35. Summary of the Decision |
| | ၃၆။ ယခုကာလဝယ် ထေရဝါဒဗုဒ္ဓသာသနာတော်၌ ဘိက္ခုနီဖြစ်နေခွင့်ရှိပုံကို ပရိကပ္ပအားဖြင့် ပြဆိုခြင်း ။ ၇၅ | 36. Explanation of the Strategy How An Opportunity Can Arise for Bhikkhunīs in the Buddha’s Dispensation of Theravāda in the Present Time . 75 |

Here the book’s “contents” portion ends. First pages of the text itself should be appearing in next NewPilgrims, little by little. ☺

May All Beings Be Happy,
monk Saraṇa